

Fulbright New Century Scholars Program “Challenges of Health in a Borderless World”

Mid-term Report

Micaela S. Iovine
Senior Program Officer, Global Programs
CIES

This Report is intended not only to present the outcomes of the New Century Scholars Program (NCS) mid-term meeting in Eger, but also to document the various projects and collaborative or individual activities the scholars have initiated subsequent to their initial orientation meeting at Bellagio, a number of which were reported at Eger or shortly afterwards.

One of the recommendations to emerge from the orientation meeting at the Rockefeller Conference Center in Bellagio that launched NCS in October 2001, was the proposal for a second, mid-term meeting. NCS scholars believed that such a meeting could build on the success of the in-person interaction achieved at Bellagio and give impetus to promoting new collaborative relationships among the participants and realizing the common goals set for the program as a whole. As a result of the initiative of the Hungarian NCS participant, Dr. Borisz Szegal, working closely with NCS Distinguished Scholar Leader, Prof. Ilona Kickbusch, and CIES staff, a mid-term workshop was proposed for Eger, Hungary. A combination of cost sharing by the Rockefeller Foundation (through Bellagio residual funds) and ECA, and the administrative support of the Fulbright Commission in Budapest made the event a reality. Rockefeller funds were particularly important to this effort since they made it possible to bring the non-US NCS Fellows, traveling from all over the world, to Hungary for the meeting. Also significant to realizing the event were the logistical and administrative contributions of the Hungarian Fulbright Commission, which assumed responsibility for all *in situ* arrangements.

The NCS workshop was planned for April 25-28, but NCS scholars were also invited by the Hungarian Fulbright Commission to participate in a conference organized to celebrate its tenth anniversary and held at the Hungarian Academy of Sciences in Budapest, April 23-24. NCS was highlighted in the program as an example of the kind of innovation possible in the Fulbright Program in the new millennium. A special panel gave the NCS Fellows the opportunity to present the various NCS projects and collaborative activities, as well as their own individual research in the area of global health. Comments from conference attendees indicated that they were clearly impressed by the caliber of the scholars' presentations and the potential impact of their activities on major health issues worldwide.

The NCS workshop itself took place in the baroque city of Eger, at its historic Lyceum, immediately following the Hungarian Commission conference. Twenty-six of the thirty NCS Fellows, along with the NCS Distinguished Scholar Leader, Prof. Ilona Kickbusch, were able to arrange their schedules to travel to Hungary for both the Fulbright conference and the Eger workshop.

The two and a half day NCS workshop was divided into large plenary sessions at the beginning and close of each day with smaller working group meetings and research roundtables taking place throughout the day. The plenary sessions were devoted to discussions of key policy reports on world health, e.g. the WHO reports on mental health and on the macroeconomics of health (spearheaded by NCS Working Group 4); the formulation of a standard definition of global health (which currently does not exist in the field of public health); progress reports from the NCS working groups; development of a proposal for the creation of an association for global health studies and network for international capacity building in health; and preliminary discussion of the NCS final plenary meeting and policy dialogue to be held at PAHO on November 6 in Washington, D.C. The smaller working group meetings gave the scholars the opportunity to work more closely on developing the various projects that had been included in the action plans created as the result of the Bellagio meeting in October 2002. The research roundtables brought scholars together in groups based on research affinities to report on their individual research projects as well as to provide feedback to one another and examine new avenues of potential future collaboration.

While the Eger meeting was only half as long as the initial gathering at Bellagio, the outcomes and results were numerous and significant, attesting to the fact that the groundwork laid at Bellagio for future interaction among the scholars was not only solid but a necessary prerequisite for the success of a program of this nature.

The outcomes of the NCS workshop can be identified on three levels:

- 1) Individual research projects**
- 2) Working Group products**
- 3) Overall NCS product**

Individual Research Projects

The basic objective of the Fulbright New Century Scholars Program is to bring a group of highly qualified international scholars and professionals together to engage in research and dialogue on topics of universal significance from a multidisciplinary perspective. The program anticipates that through their interactions with one another and with host colleagues during their international exchange visits, the NCS scholars will explore new perspectives and interdisciplinary approaches as well as add new comparative elements to their research. NCS scholar presentations at the Eger research roundtables, along with subsequent discussions among the scholars related to their research interests and methodologies, were a clear indication of the fruitful and innovative research collaborations developing as a result of the scholar interaction inaugurated at Bellagio and given further impetus at Eger. Examples so far of the impact of NCS on individual and collaborative research accomplishments include:

- Submission to NIH of a joint proposal by NCS Scholars Kearsley Stewart (Northwestern University) and Seggane Musisi (Makarere University, Uganda) to encourage and strengthen intellectual, institutional and research linkages between biomedical, public

health, and behavioral scientists at Makerere U through the collaborative development of innovative interdisciplinary HIV/AIDS research and interventions

- Development for submission to NIH of a joint proposal by NCS Scholars Nelly Salgado de Snyder (Mexican National Institute of Public Health), Peter Koehn (University of Montana, Missoula), Gabriele Bammer (The Australian National University), Boris Szegal (Dunajvaros Polytechnic, Hungary), Seggane Musisi (Makerere University, Uganda), and Richard Mollica (Harvard Program in Refugee Trauma) on the social and cultural dimensions of health
- Selection of NCS Scholar Howard Waitzkin (University of New Mexico) as a Guggenheim Fellow for an expansion of his NCS work on economic globalization and public health
- Selection of NCS Scholar James Riley (Indiana University) for a National Endowment of the Humanities grant to continue his NCS research on the ability of certain poor and middle-income countries to achieve high life expectancy as a model for securing better survival for unfavored groups in the US population
- Acceptance for publication of article on “A Globalized Theory of Public Health Law,” by NCS Scholar David Fidler (Indiana University Law School) to appear in *Journal of Law, Medicine, & Ethics* 30 (2002)
- Selection by the Pan American Health Organization (PAHO) of NCS Scholar from Peru, Marcos Cueto, to write a history of that organization
- Submission of a joint paper by Craig Janes (University of Colorado, Denver) and Kearsley Stewart (Northwestern University) on “The Transition from International to Global Health: A View from Medical Anthropology” to the *Medical Anthropology Quarterly*

Working Group Products

Four “Working Groups” emerged as the result of the NCS inaugural orientation and goal setting meeting at Bellagio: Working Group 1 (WG1) on Global Health Studies; Working Group 2 (WG2) on Global Health Research; Working Group 3 (WG3) on the Local/Global Interface; and Working Group 4 (WG4) on Global Health Insight. The working groups were to be ongoing and provide *fora* for the further discussion of overall program objectives and program development throughout the year. To facilitate the accomplishment of NCS working group objectives, CIES staff created the NCS Website (<http://ncs-globalhealth.iienetwork.org/>) to support the work of the working groups by providing a platform for discussion, commentary, the exchange of documents and the posting of NCS-related information. The site, which is currently restricted to use by the NCS scholars only, may eventually be opened to the interested global health community and provide it with opportunities for interaction and dialogue with the NCS scholars on current issues in health.

At Eger, the four working groups presented reports on their “action plans” that had been developed by each group immediately after Bellagio. Through feedback and input into the individual working group products by all the NCS scholars in plenary sessions, the working group products became products of the group as a whole. There were clearly points of contact and overlap in number of areas, as well as a number of elements that contributed to shaping some of the overall NCS outcomes.

Working Group 1 on Global Health Studies had two basic objectives: 1) to develop a conceptual framework of global health studies; and 2) to develop postgraduate studies in global health. Acknowledging that a satisfactory critical mass of investigators and practitioners skilled in global health does not currently exist, members of the group focused on developing a multidisciplinary course which would meet the need for a more comprehensive understanding of the relationship between globalization and human health for future physicians, policy-makers and public health experts. WGI Group Leader Pim Martens (Maastricht University, Netherlands) submitted a proposal to the European Commission for an international course or summer school on global health. The course would rotate annually to a different location and be taught by local as well as visiting international specialists, including Fulbright scholars. In addition, NCS scholar from Cameroon (University of Younde) indicated that his institution's medical school, of which he is dean, would be interested in hosting the summer course. The NCS scholar from Mexico also indicated possible interest on the part of her institution, the National Institute of Public Health, in such a course.

WG1 also tasked itself with formulating an interdisciplinary global health studies curriculum that might provide direction and serve as the basis for defining the emerging field of "global health." The curriculum would be implemented through the compilation of an edited volume of readings on "global health." WG1 asked NCS scholars to contribute a short list of topics that might constitute the core content for a global health course as well as to indicate any course content they might be willing to contribute to the proposed international summer school course.

WG1 also addressed the need for a Global Health Studies association that would not only provide systematic support and direction for the emerging field, help bridge the gap between scientific research, practical implementation and policy making, but would also encourage the development of a transnational professional community of diverse and multidisciplinary investigators and practitioners on both the local and global levels. The development of a global health studies association was discussed at several plenary sessions and in smaller group meetings at Eger and emerged at the end of the two and half day workshop as one of the recommended overall NCS outcomes (see section on Overall NCS Product below).

Working Group 2 on Global Health Research also had two objectives: 1) to clarify issues relevant to the conduct of interdisciplinary, collaborative, global health research, including research priorities, integrative research methods, and research ethics; and 2) to identify and organize collaborative projects for the NCS group which address these topics.

At Eger, WG2 reported that it had produced three collaborative position papers on each of the issues outlined in their first objective above. The priority of these papers was to address these issues as they directly related to current research by WG2 members; subsequently, WG2 anticipated integrating contributions from the rest of the NCS scholars.

The first position paper on research priorities in global health discussed principles and methods of identifying and establishing research priorities in global health so that they could help define the field and assist its growth and development by encouraging and guiding researchers to enter this area and funders to support it. The second position paper on integrative research methods

reviewed the methods for integrative, i.e. interdisciplinary research in global health and demonstrated how integrative research methods could be applied to global health problems. The final position paper on research ethics in global health aimed to provoke debate on the nature of research ethics in the context of global health by focusing on the limitations of standardized procedures and formal oversight committees to ensure “ethical” research and raising the question: How do research ethics change when the context of research shifts from international health to global health studies? By drawing first on the experience of the NCS scholars as a group, WG2 hopes ultimately to determine whether there is a universal set of ethical dilemmas arising in most international collaborative health research and whether there are universal solutions. Publication of the finalized position papers is still under discussion by WG2

Examples of collaborative projects proposed by WG2 to be undertaken by NCS group as a whole included:

- Bibliographies relevant to the research concerns of the NCS scholars
- Collection of case studies related to these three topics and derived from field work as NCS scholars

Working Group 3 on the Local/Global Interface concentrated on the exploration, analysis, and description of the links between, or processes that link, global forces (e.g., trade, health reform, health development, the actions of international civil society) to health, broadly defined, in particular local/community settings. The group’s discussions at Eger explored three particular dimensions of the local-global articulation: 1) what might be termed the “factors” of globalization; 2) the impact of these factors of globalization on the proximate determinants of health; and 3) the governance and policy dimensions of global health, which range from the very local efforts of communities and civil society to bring attention to particular health and health care issues, to national and emerging institutions (and models of) global governance.

Group 3 is developing a paper that would provide a theoretical framework for understanding the local-global links based on illustrative materials solicited from the NCS scholars. As a long-range goal, the group is planning a book project that would invite NCS scholars to provide case studies that demonstrate one or more dimensions of the local-global problem.

Pratiwi Sudarmono (University of Indonesia) has assumed co-chairship of WG3 along with current chair, Craig Janes (University of Colorado, Denver).

Working Group 4 on Global Health Insight charged itself with making connections between research, policy and local public health action. The group seeks to promote interdisciplinary discussion by all NCS scholars of the more significant recent policy statements in global health, including the WHO Report on Mental Health, the WHO Commission Report on Macroeconomics and Health, and “Dying for Change,” the WHO and World Bank ‘Voices of the Poor’ Project publication on health. The group anticipated using the materials produced through the NCS commentaries to generate one or more brief papers, designed for wide circulation across global health and mental health policy communities, in the form of op-ed pieces and letters to journals. There was also some discussion of producing “reader guides” that would make the reports more accessible to health specialists, practitioners and administrators on both local and

national levels and provide some guidance in terms of the practical application of the reports' recommendations..

The group is also interested in developing “knowledge into action” projects designed to connect global discourse to local change and will solicit suggestions from all NCS scholars.

WG4 has already initiated posting commentary on the reports listed above and has solicited input from all NCS scholars.

Overall NCS Product

The Eger meeting, which crystallized a number of processes that were initiated in Bellagio, resulted in a general consensus regarding overall outcomes for the scholars as a group and the NCS Program as a whole. Scholars were unanimous in agreeing that they (and thru them the program) had the potential for having a significant impact in the field of public health at both the local and global levels in a number of concrete ways:

- 1) Formulation of a standardized definition of global, as opposed to international, health that would be accepted and applied through academic, professional, governmental, and grant making communities
- 2) Creation of a Global Health Studies Network that would promote international capacity building in health through improved collaboration between the North and the South
- 3) Development of a set of policy recommendations to impact health research and practice on the global and local levels

Definition of Global Health

At Eger the scholars determined that they needed a mutually agreed upon “mission” statement that could reflect their overall purpose as a group as well as provide direction for their ultimate goals. They determined that the formulation of a standardized definition of global health was seminal to informing the directions and activities of the NCS working groups, laying the basis for the development of any policy recommendations and establishing the guiding principles for shaping a new interdisciplinary field of global health, something the scholars saw as a unique contribution by the group as a whole.

As a distinctive blend of public health specialists and social scientists brought together under the banner of NCS, the scholars believed they were in a unique position to contribute to developing the dialogue on health across disciplinary borders, especially. with respect to bringing social scientists into the debate on resolving the myriad challenges posed by global health. In this way, they hoped not only to expand the disciplinary territory of the field but also to add something entirely new to it through the interdisciplinary approach. The concomitant creation of a Global Health Studies Network would provide the systematic means of support for the emerging new field and encourage the development of a critical mass of diverse and multidisciplinary investigators and practitioners at the local and global levels in both the North and South.

Prior to the Eger workshop, NCS Distinguished Scholar Leader Ilona Kickbusch had provided the scholars with a one-page discussion of the term “global health.” Scholars agreed that the term international health implied approaches to health problems in developing countries with the emphasis on the flow of resources and knowledge from the developed to the developing world. “Global Health,” in contrast, focused on the impact of global interdependence on the determinants of health, the transfer of health risks and the policy response of countries, international organizations and the many other actors in the global health arena. Its goal is the equitable access to health in all regions of the globe.

As a result of plenary discussions on this topic, an adhoc group of four scholars was formed to craft a short statement on global health that was immediately circulated at the meeting and posted on the NCS web site:

Global Health Studies is a way of thinking and acting that recognized that human well being is increasingly shaped by interdependent forces that move with great speed and transcend national and local borders.

Global Health Studies focuses on:

- ❖ global distribution and causes of health and disease
- ❖ impact of globalization on health
- ❖ impact of health on globalization
- ❖ changing nature of global health governance

Global Health Studies seeks to understand how ideology, ethics, and history forge the production, distribution and equitable use of health knowledge and practice.

Global Health Studies develops strategies that

- ❖ integrate a wide range of knowledge and disciplines
- ❖ break down barriers between policy sectors
- ❖ support inclusive and participatory systems of governance

The aim of *Global Health Studies* is to elucidate all of the factors and dynamics that influence equitable access to health in all regions of the world.

Following the Eger meeting, a second, more developed statement will be produced through input via the NCS web site by all the scholars to flesh out and elaborate on the major principles of the shorter statement.

Global Health Studies Network

One of the principal recommendations for further action to emerge from Bellagio was the development of a conceptual framework and proposal for post graduate “global health studies.” In the interval between Bellagio and Eger, however, this objective was expanded significantly beyond a proposal for the creation of an academic program. Under the leadership of the

Distinguished Scholar Leader, an adhoc group of the scholars prepared a preliminary proposal for the creation of a professional association for the promotion of knowledge and capacity building in health on the global level. The proposal was discussed by all the scholars in plenary sessions at Eger and a number of suggestions were made relating to its goal, conceptual framework, administrative structure, and implementation. There was unanimous agreement that the basic idea for a global health studies organization that draws its strength from a cross-disciplinary and interdisciplinary framework rather than being a single “discipline” could be a unique contribution to the field of public health made possible by the NCS concept.

The establishment of a global health studies network was proposed as a new mechanism of independent international scholarly collaboration and capacity building driven by the need to bring a multiplicity of perspectives and approaches to global health challenges, a commitment to equal participation between researchers from the North and the South, and a desire to create an international North-South professional cadre capable of criticizing and influencing decisions on the allocations of resources to support health, whether made by government agencies, multi-lateral donors or private foundations.

The proposed Network would actively support:

- the systematic strengthening of institutions in the South
- the involvement of a wider group of scholars and disciplines
- the initiation of new collaborative research projects
- the regular dialogue between researchers, policy makers and donors
- the implementation of research results into practical solutions on both global and local levels
- the development of an academic curriculum for global health studies

The network will be independent and transnational and builds on a culture of reciprocity from the very start. All its projects will be characterized through both a collaborative North/South and multi disciplinary effort. It will help shape the field of global health studies and research in the future.

NCS scholars from the developing countries were particularly supportive and enthusiastic about the proposal for global health studies network. After Eger, all NCS scholars will continue to provide input into the final formulation of the proposal with the anticipated goal of announcing its creation at the final NCS plenary meeting at PAHO in November.

Development of Policy Recommendations and the Final NCS Plenary Seminar

Distinguished Scholar Leader Ilona Kickbusch reminded the NCS scholars that a basic expectation of the NCS Program for the final plenary seminar was the development of a set of policy recommendations that would hopefully have some impact on how government agencies, international organizations, NGO's, and private foundations respond to the various challenges raised by health in a global society. The scholars felt strongly that their individual research should be policy relevant as well as have practical applications on the local level. WG4, which was very much interested in developing strategies and mechanisms for transforming "knowledge into action," was tasked with developing a set of preliminary recommendations for further discussion by NCS scholars and final formulation at the Airlie House retreat prior to the final public NCS seminar at PAHO, where the recommendations would be presented. One such recommendation would probably address the need for funders in health who consider themselves within a narrow national framework (e.g. Robert Wood Johnson) to reconsider their roles within the new context of global health in the 21st century. Kickbusch advised scholars that she would be soliciting their input as she began developing the agenda for the Airlie retreat and the final seminar.

Other NCS Outcomes

Although less formulated than the proposal for a global health studies association/network, several other suggestions for potential spin-offs from NCS were raised at Eger and discussed by the scholars in plenary sessions. Further development of these various avenues will be explored by individual scholars or groups of interested scholars and any tangible results reported prior to or at the final plenary seminar. The more promising of these ideas include:

- Creation of a *Journal of Global Health*
- Exporting the NCS "methodology" to other countries as a model for national endeavors
- Integrating global health into other aspects of the core Fulbright Program, not only through introduction of global health awards but through development of a student program in global health based on the NCS model
- Exploration of ways to integrate NCS I on global health with NCS II on Addressing Sectarian, Ethnic and Cultural Conflict within and across National Borders and create synergies between the two programs

The Distinguished Scholar Leader advised scholars that Oxford University Press had been responsive to the proposal for an interdisciplinary *Journal of Global Health*. The Press already publishes the *Journal of Public Health* and had expressed an interest in a *Journal of Global Health* as a potential companion series. With respect to exporting the NCS model to other countries, NCS scholar Alfred Spira (Hopital de Bicetre, France) indicated the interest in such an enterprise expressed by Jean-Francois Girard, the new president of the IRD (Institute of Research for Development) which has offices throughout Africa, the South Pacific, Latin America/Caribbean. Additionally, Nelly Salgado de Snyder seconded the interest of her home

institution, the National Institute of Public Health, the largest such governmental public health agency in South America, which would be receptive to promoting such an endeavor, possibly in conjunction with the OAS. The suggestions regarding the possible permutations of the first year of the New Century Scholars Program on global health in the future through the Fulbright Program itself, including a student program in global health based on the NCS model, will be formulated as recommendations to be presented at the final plenary seminar. A number of scholars, especially Richard Mollica and Seggane Musisi, emphasized the clear overlap and natural bridge between the two NCS program themes because of the obvious impact of civil strife, conflict and violence on health and disease and all the interdisciplinary issues related to dealing with the traumatized victims of such events.

Other Related NCS Activities

A number of other activities have resulted subsequent to the Bellagio and Eger meetings. While these do not involve specific research activities or projects, they too are examples of spin-off activities that would not have been possible without the opportunities for interaction and the development of new partnerships provided by Bellagio and Eger serving as catalyst. One of the most noteworthy such developments involves Prof. Richard Mollica, Director of the Harvard Program in Refugee Trauma. As a result of his interaction with a number of the non-US NCS scholars, Prof. Mollica has been able to include additional Ministers of Health (Uganda, Peru, Indonesia) into his NCS supported project to bring together the Ministers of Health from post-conflict countries in for a conference in Sarajevo in September 2002. The meeting, which would allow participants to explore new principles and practices for recovery of conflict/post-conflict societies, represents the first time a high-level, international meeting has been organized to address mental health challenges and solutions in post-conflict societies. Other Ministers of Health who will be present include those from Cambodia, Bosnia, Rwanda, Afghanistan, among others.

NCS Scholar Craig Janes (University of Colorado-Denver)) had been working with a university faculty colleague in health administration to develop an academic program and research center in international health. As a result of Prof. Janes involvement with the NCS working groups at Bellagio and Eger, he has been able to contribute new perspectives, insights and preliminary curricular materials to the project, resulting in the renaming and reorientation of the proposed program to the Global Health Studies Program with Prof. Janes as the Associate Director and Chair of the Exec Committee for Program Development.

NCS scholars have also been active as individuals or as groups making presentations or participating in invited panels dealing with topical issues in global health. A two-day workshop organized by the Institute of Medicine on "The Impact of Globalization on Infectious Disease Emergence and Control" in April 2002, included presentations based on their NCS research projects by NCS Scholars Andrey Demin (Russian Public Health Association) on "Social Aspects of Public Health Challenges in Period of Globalization, and David Fidler on "International Law, Infectious Disease, and Globalization." NCS Scholar Ann Marie Kimball (University of Washington, Seattle) also participated as an invited discussant in a roundtable

discussion focusing on “Considering the Resources and the Capacity for Response.” The workshop, which was attended by leading academic, governmental, NGO and industry representatives from public health institutions, international organizations, USG agencies, and pharmaceutical companies, provided the NCS Scholars with an opportunity to familiarize workshop participants with the research objectives of NCS and its scholars

NCS Scholars have also been invited by schools of public health and the CDC to make presentations related to their NCS related research. For example, two NCS Scholars, Marcos Cueto (Universidad Peruana Cayetano Heredia, Peru) and Yanhai Wan (China Renmin University) were invited to make presentations of their NCS research at Columbia University School of Public Health. Dr. Wan participated in a seminar on AIDS in China and Dr. Cueto was invited to participate in the Forum in the History of Public Health in International Contexts with a presentation on the failure of WHO’s global eradication of Malaria program. NCS Scholar David Fidler addressed the International Conference on Emerging Infectious Diseases, sponsored by the U.S. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, on “Global Health, Emerging Infectious Diseases, and International Regulations.”